



CITY *of* PERTH

MINUTES

WORKS AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

7 APRIL 2010

PRESIDING MEMBER'S
SIGNATURE

DATE:-----

WORKS AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

INDEX

Item	Description	Page
WK71/10	DECLARATION OF OPENING	1
WK72/10	APOLOGIES	1
WK73/10	MEMBERS ON LEAVE OF ABSENCE AND APPLICATIONS FOR LEAVE OF ABSENCE	1
WK74/10	CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES	2
WK75/10	CORRESPONDENCE	2
WK76/10	DISCLOSURE OF MEMBERS' INTERESTS	2
WK77/10	REINTRODUCTION OF TWO-WAY TRAFFIC ON BEAUFORT STREET AND JAMES STREET STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK	2
WK78/10	TENDER 042-09/10 - SPECIALISED CLEANING OF ROADS AND FOOTPATHS	9
WK79/10	TENDER 054-09/10 - PAINTING MAINTENANCE PANEL	13
WK80/10	TENDER 070-09/10 - WILLIAM STREET NORTHBRIDGE (ROE TO NEWCASTLE STREETS) - LIGHTING AND ELECTRICAL UPGRADE WORKS	17
WK81/10	TENDER 085-09/10 - SUPPLY OF MEDIUM PAVEMENT SWEEPER AND SALE OF TWO SWEEPERS	20
WK82/10	TENDER 093-09/10 - DISPOSAL OF TWO REAR LOADER REFUSE TRUCKS	23
WK83/10	MOTIONS OF WHICH PREVIOUS NOTICE HAS BEEN GIVEN	25
WK84/10	GENERAL BUSINESS	26
WK85/10	ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION AT A FUTURE MEETING	26
WK86/10	CLOSE OF MEETING	26

Minutes of the meeting of the City of Perth **Works and Urban Development Committee** held in Committee Room 1, Ninth Floor, Council House, 27 St Georges Terrace, Perth on **Wednesday, 7 April 2010**.

MEMBERS IN ATTENDANCE

Cr McEvoy - Presiding Member
The Lord Mayor
Cr Limnios

OFFICERS

Mr Edwards - Chief Executive Officer
Mr Dunne - Director Service Units
Mr Forster - Director Business Units
Mr Monks - Director Planning and Development
Mr Kingdom - Manager Urban Development
Mr Hegney - Acting Governance Coordinator

OBSERVERS

Cr Tognolini
Cr Rodgers

WK71/10 DECLARATION OF OPENING

The Presiding Member declared the meeting open at 5.30pm.

WK72/10 APOLOGIES

Nil

WK73/10 MEMBERS ON LEAVE OF ABSENCE AND APPLICATIONS FOR LEAVE OF ABSENCE

Nil

WK74/10 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

Moved by Cr McEvoy, seconded by the Lord Mayor

That the minutes of the meeting of the Works and Urban Development Committee held on 15 March 2010 be confirmed as a true and correct record.

The motion was put and carried

The votes were recorded as follows:-

For: The Lord Mayor, Crs McEvoy and Limnios

Against: Nil

WK75/10 CORRESPONDENCE

Nil

WK76/10 DISCLOSURE OF MEMBERS' INTERESTS

Nil

**WK77/10 REINTRODUCTION OF TWO-WAY TRAFFIC ON
BEAUFORT STREET AND JAMES STREET
STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK**

BACKGROUND:

FILE REFERENCE: P1024561
REPORTING OFFICER: John McDonald
RESPONSIBLE DIRECTOR: Peter Monks, Director Planning and Development
DATE: 26 March 2010
MAP / SCHEDULE: Schedule 1 - Consultation letter and concept plan
Schedule 2 - Consultation feedback summary

At its meeting held on **8 December 2009**, the Council approved the concept plan for Beaufort Street and James Street and noted that it would be released for community and stakeholder consultation. The concept plan was distributed for consultation between January 2010 to the 12 February 2010. This consultation included:-

- Property owners and tenants along Beaufort Street.
- State Government agencies and service authorities.
- City of Perth officers and working groups.

A copy of the letter and concept plan distributed to property owners / tenants is included as Schedule 1. A summary of the consultation feedback is detailed in Schedule 2.

LEGISLATION / STRATEGIC PLAN / POLICY:

Strategic Plan Movement, Transport and Parking
Begin a staged implementation of the movement plan including changing one-way traffic to two-way traffic

DETAILS:

The feedback received was generally supportive of the proposal of converting Beaufort Street back to two-way traffic. The main issues arising from the feedback are summarised below:-

Stakeholder	Feedback
Town of Vincent - Strategic Issues	<p>As Beaufort Street and William Street continue into the Town of Vincent, there are traffic implications for how the overall road network will operate. To realise the greatest benefits of reintroducing two-way traffic flow on those roads, the roads also need to be made two-way north of the City's boundary at Newcastle Street. That will result in a more legible and permeable road network.</p> <p>The City has been discussing these matters with the Town of Vincent including two presentations by the City of Perth to Elected Members at the Town of Vincent and recently at a Council Forum held on 16 February 2010. A detailed report on two-way traffic is soon to be presented to the Town of Vincent by its administration and the results of which will be communicated to the City of Perth at a later date.</p>
Proposed response:-	The City of Perth continues to work in collaboration with the Town of Vincent to resolve any outstanding issues to enable two-way traffic to be implemented.

Stakeholder	Feedback
<p>WA Police - The need for on-street parking outside Curtin House</p>	<p>The Perth District Police Station is located in Curtin House on the eastern side of Beaufort Street, north of James Street, and the WA Police currently have a number of on-street parking bays reserved for its exclusive use. The use of those bays enables the police to rapidly respond to emergencies and general call-outs. Consultation with the WA Police has confirmed that the availability of on-street parking in Beaufort Street is critical to its operations.</p> <p>Rather than operating the Clearway on both sides of Beaufort Street in both peak hours, one option suggested is to operate a Clearway:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • on the eastern side of the road in the morning peak hour to accommodate southbound traffic entering the Central Business District (CBD); • on the western side of the road in the afternoon peak hour to accommodate northbound traffic exiting the CBD. <p>During morning peak hour, the reserved parking bays on the eastern side of the road could be replaced with six reserved parking bays on the western side of the road. This will meet the objective of providing Clearways to facilitate an efficient movement of traffic, in particular for buses, and ensure that the WA Police can continue to rapidly respond to emergencies and general call-outs.</p> <p>The need for this reserved parking should then be reviewed in two years time when the Perth District Police Station will relocate to the new building on Fitzgerald Street. Specialist Police Units will remain in Curtin House but reduced parking needs will hopefully be accommodated off-street.</p>
<p>Proposed response:-</p>	<p>Provision will be made to allow the WA Police to have on-street bays in both morning and afternoon peak by reserving bays on both sides of the street. This arrangement will be reviewed following the completion of the new Police building on Fitzgerald Street.</p>

Stakeholder	Feedback
<p>Pilpel Printing - Impact of proposed Clearway on Loading Zone</p>	<p>Pilpel Printing expressed concern that it will lose customers to other businesses if it is unable to use an existing loading zone located outside its premises on Beaufort Street for the delivery and pick-up of pallets loaded with printing and binding work during the proposed Clearway times. This is not an issue outside of any Clearway times as use of the loading zone will be maintained outside those times.</p> <p>The property has two vehicular crossovers located on Beaufort Street that provide access to the building and an on-site service area, which at the time of inspection was occupied with printing / binding materials. Adjacent to the property is a three metre wide right-of-way (ROW) that connects Beaufort Street to Stirling Street.</p> <p>At the request of the City, the owner of the printing business has supplied a record of deliveries for a week to help understand the demand for use of the loading zone during Clearway times. The analysis of the supplied delivery data found that the greatest servicing demand occurs during the proposed morning Clearway period.</p> <p>Initially, it was thought that it might be possible to trial the continued use of the loading zone during Clearway times for a 12 month period when it was expected that Beaufort Street would only have two-way traffic south of Newcastle Street. This is permissible under the Road Traffic Code.</p> <p>However, this option is no longer considered possible due to the following:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reviewing the supplied truck loading / unloading data and determining that use of the loading zone during peak hours would create an unacceptable impact on the operation of the Clearway and bus movements. • Reviewing the development approval for the subject premises and identifying that an off-street truck bay, which was provided but is currently occupied by bulk printing / binding material, was included as part of the alterations and extensions approved in April 1998. • Consulting with other City officers has identified that there is a history to truck loading / unloading issues at that location involving safety issues forklifts using the road and footpath. <p style="text-align: right;">(Cont'd)</p>

Stakeholder	Feedback
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased recognition of Beaufort Street as a strategic bus route, based on ongoing discussions with the Public Transport Authority (PTA) and Main Road Western Australia (MRWA). • Further discussions with the Town of Vincent about the implementation of two-way traffic on Beaufort Street, north of Newcastle Street. <p>Given the strategic importance of implementing two-way traffic in Beaufort Street and providing Clearways for both morning and afternoon movements, the following options could be considered:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Manage all loading / unloading of vehicle on-site during Clearway / Bus Lane times within the property boundary. This would require all bulk print material currently being stored in the service area to be stored elsewhere. • The business advising clients about the need for deliveries to occur outside of Clearway operating times. • Investigate the potential use of the lane adjacent to the premises during Clearway times by small vehicles such as cars and vans.
Proposed response:-	The City to inform Pilpel Printing that the loading zone will be unavailable during morning peak hour and alternative arrangements will need to be implemented as noted above.
<p>EPRA</p> <p>Central Institute of Technology</p> <p>Heritage Council WA - Heritage Awnings</p>	<p>There are several awnings to heritage buildings on the west side of Beaufort Street, immediately south of Newcastle Street, at risk of being hit by tall vehicles under the current draft concept plan.</p> <p>To address this issue, it is confirmed that the road geometry can be modified slightly as part of the detailed design to provide adequate clearance between the traffic lane and the awnings.</p>
Proposed response:-	Advise all relevant stakeholders that this issue will be resolved during detailed design phase.

Stakeholder	Feedback
<p>Department of Transport (DOT) - Strategic Bus Routes to the city</p>	<p>The Department of Transport considers that it is premature to progress the Beaufort Street project until there is <i>“an established consolidated view and broad agreement on the City’s movement network”</i>.</p> <p>The reintroduction of two-way traffic on Beaufort Street and a number of other one-way roads, as adopted by the Council and contained in the City’s Draft Urban Design Framework, is an important strategy to improve the city’s movement network. Whilst it is acknowledged that discussion and planning activity that includes the city’s movement network is occurring in various forums, there is no guarantee that consensus will be achieved by all parties in all forums.</p> <p>However, these roads are the responsibility of the City and the work planned for Beaufort Street will improve the legibility and permeability of the local road network. The proposed works are also minimal enough to allow the proposed changes to be reversed or further changes readily made to the road, if that is deemed necessary.</p>
<p>Proposed response:-</p>	<p>The DOT is advised that the City is proactively involved in discussions with many State Government Agencies regarding strategic transport routes and will continue with these discussions. However, the conversion of Beaufort Street and William Street back to two-way traffic does not preclude any outcome of the broader debate. It only improves permeability and legibility of the network.</p>
<p>Mr C Berbatis - Criticism of the consultation process</p>	<p>City officers have dealt with a significant volume of email, written and telephone communications from business owner Mr Berbatis who has criticised the consultation process and the level of information supplied to businesses. Considerable resources have been directed to providing answers and information to respond to the various issues raised. Mr Berbatis was also given an extended deadline to provide comment on the Beaufort Street concept plan. To date, the City of Perth has not received any specific comments from Mr Berbatis regarding the project design.</p>
<p>Proposed response:-</p>	<p>The Council notes the considerable resources expended in attempting to respond as fully as possible to the issues raised by Mr Berbatis. The Council notes correspondence received from Mr Berbatis.</p>

Stakeholder	Feedback
Various - comments regarding the design	A number of minor design related comments have been provided that will be considered during the detailed design stage of the project.
Proposed response:-	Consideration given to minor design issues raised during detailed design stage.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

There are no direct financial implications related to this report.

COMMENTS:

Generally, there is stakeholder support for reintroducing two-way traffic back into Beaufort Street. The more significant issues highlighted in this report shall be responded to as noted in the proposed responses above.

Significantly, the City of Perth is waiting for formal comments from the Town of Vincent regarding detailed issues on the conversion in regards to timing. In addition, there are some broader issues being raised by State Government Agencies regarding strategic transport routes. It is therefore proposed that a further report be presented to the Council at a future date covering the following specific matters:-

- Comments from the Town of Vincent.
- Strategic transport routes.
- Timing of two-way for William Street.
- Timing of two-way for Beaufort Street (and James Street east).
- Update regarding approvals from Main Roads WA.

Moved by Cr McEvoy, seconded by the Lord Mayor

That the Council:-

- 1. receives the feedback from the stakeholder consultation period and supports the proposed responses as noted in the report dated 26 March 2010, for the reintroduction of two-way traffic on Beaufort Street and James Street;***
- 2. notes that the Town of Vincent has indicated general support for the concept, however, will be providing formal comments at a future date;***

(Cont'd)

- 3. notes that a report will be presented to the Council in April / May 2010 with a detailed proposal for the conversion of both William Street and Beaufort Street, with particular focus on the phasing and timing issues involved.**

The motion was put and carried

The votes were recorded as follows:-

For: The Lord Mayor, Crs McEvoy and Limnios

Against: Nil

At this point in the meeting and in accordance with Section 9.2 of the City of Perth Standing Orders Local Law 2009, Items 78/10 to 82/10 inclusive, were adopted en bloc.

WK78/10 TENDER 042-09/10 - SPECIALISED CLEANING OF ROADS AND FOOTPATHS

BACKGROUND:

FILE REFERENCE: P1025499
REPORTING OFFICER: Mel Wilson
RESPONSIBLE DIRECTOR: Doug Forster, Director Business Units
DATE: 17 March 2010
MAP / SCHEDULE: Schedule 3 - Schedule of Rates

Tenders have been invited from suitably qualified and experienced contractors for specialised cleaning of roads and footpaths within the city of Perth. The tender supplements the City's own routine footpath and road cleaning services and adds specialised cleaning and removal of items such as chewing gum, oil, grease, paints, and various waste stains. The tender closed 21 January 2010.

LEGISLATION / STRATEGIC PLAN / POLICY:

Legislation	Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996 Part 4 - Tenders for providing Goods and Services
Strategic Plan	Urban and Built Environment Improvements to “street level” public spaces will be a priority, including city streets, boulevards and laneways, to improve the pedestrian amenity and create diverse, vibrant and safe public spaces
Policy	
Policy No and Name:	9.7 - Purchasing Policy

DETAILS:

At close of tender, three submissions were received, being from:-

- Grime Fighters Australia Pty Ltd.
- Spot’s All Surface Cleaning.
- Loxodrome Pty Ltd trading as FCT Surface Cleaning.

Tenderers were required to address the selection criteria detailed in the tender specifications and to submit a Form of Tender that included a Schedule of Rates (Schedule 3).

The tender submission was assessed against the selection criteria as set out in the specifications. Tenderers were required to address all selection criteria in detail in order to demonstrate both their qualifications and experience in supplying the specified items. The selection criteria included:-

- Relevant experience.
- Compliance with specifications.
- Class methodology.
- Tenderer’s resources.
- Disposal of chemicals.
- Schedule of rates.

Tender specifications called for the removal of a number of stain types with various degrees of removal difficulty. These were separated into the following Classes:-

Class 1	Non-chemical cleaning of food waste, excreta and discharge due to vomiting, expectoration and putrescible waste including necessary chemical sanitation.
Class 2	Chemical cleaning of fuel spills, surface grease and oil, fatty acids, and paint.
Class 3	Cleaning of hazardous waste including, but not limited, to blood stains, prophylactics and hypodermic needles.
Class 4	Chewing gum removal.
Class 5	Intensive cleaning of pavement prior to removal and lighter cleaning when replaced. The Tender should allow for two separate Site visits.

Grime Fighters Australia Pty Ltd

Grime Fighters Australia Pty Ltd provided a very informative and thorough submission addressing all criteria and in most cases, exceeding criteria requirements. Grime Fighters Australia Pty Ltd provide similar services to a number of local governments, shopping centres and various commercial properties. The company has three trucks and three trailers all fully equipped with relevant modern equipment.

Grime Fighters Australia Pty Ltd prices vary depending upon the Class of work, particularly in respect to the removal of chewing gum which can be time consuming and difficult.

Spot's All Surface Cleaning

Spot's All Surface Cleaning submitted a reasonable offer generally meeting all criteria. The company uses various pieces of equipment to undertake required works including a fully self contained high pressure mobile unit capable of recycling up to 80% of the water used and capturing all dirt and wastes for safe disposal.

Following evaluation of Spot's All Surface Cleaning submission, the City invited the company to provide confirmation of works methodology and to demonstrate its primary equipment on a section of paving within West Perth. The company was able to confirm resources availability and works methodology to the satisfaction of the City. The cleaning process was able to remove all types of dirt and stains, including chewing gum and grease stains, to a high standard.

Spot's All Surface Cleaners submitted the same price for all Class of removal regardless of difficulty. Prices offered were the cheapest of the three submissions.

FCT Surface Cleaning

FCT Surface Cleaning supplied a good submission adequately addressing all criteria. FCT Surface Cleaning operate a variety of trailer mounted high pressure cleaners including one state of the art "clean, capture and recycle" unit.

FCT Surface Cleaning submitted the same price for all Class of removal regardless of difficulty or call out time.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

ACCOUNT NO:	Various Operating Accounts
BUDGET ITEM:	Transport - Streets, Roads, Bridges, Depots - Street - Cleaning
BUDGET PAGE NUMBER:	10
BUDGETED AMOUNT:	\$3,648,105
AMOUNT SPENT TO DATE:	\$2,109,403
PROPOSED COST:	\$ 485,000
BALANCE:	\$1,624,403

All figures quoted in this report are exclusive of GST.

COMMENTS:

It is imperative that the successful contractor has sufficient resources available at any given time to successfully complete the requirements of the contract whether given short, medium or long term notice. Although FCT Surface Cleaning met the selection criteria, some doubt exists as to whether the company has the necessary resources available to undertake the requirements of the contract within the time limits noted in the tender specifications.

Grime Fighters Australia Pty Ltd is the incumbent contractor and has been found to achieve a high standard of work, able to comply with Environmental Protection Authority regulations and traffic management requirements. However, this company's Schedule of Rates was the most expensive, particularly for Class 4, Chewing Gum removal.

Spot's All Surface Cleaning was able to demonstrate its ability, both in its submission and in the demonstration, to efficiently remove all material types from paved areas. The company has experience working in high profile areas of Fremantle and has the resources and capacity to fulfil the requirements specified in the tender documents.

Therefore, following a full evaluation of each of the submissions, it is recommended the tender for specialised cleaning of roads and footpaths be awarded to Spot's All Surface Cleaning.

Moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded by Cr McEvoy

That the Council:-

- 1. accepts the most suitable tender, being that submitted by Spot's All Surface Cleaning, for the provision of specialised cleaning of roads and footpaths in the city for a two year period commencing 3 May 2010, with a further two year option, as detailed in the Schedule of Rates (Schedule 3);***
- 2. notes the expenditure in part 1 above being charged to Budget Item 'Transport - Streets, Roads, Bridges, Depots - Street - Cleaning.'***

The motion was put and carried

The votes were recorded as follows:-

For: The Lord Mayor, Crs McEvoy and Limnios

Against: Nil

WK79/10 TENDER 054-09/10 - PAINTING MAINTENANCE PANEL

BACKGROUND:

FILE REFERENCE: P1025440
REPORTING OFFICER: Karwai Wong
RESPONSIBLE DIRECTOR: Garry Dunne, Director Service Units
DATE: 18 March 2010
MAP / SCHEDULE: Schedule 4 – Schedule of Rates

A painting maintenance panel was established in January 2007 to address the City's painting maintenance requirements within the public infrastructure and building sectors.

A sample of the works attended to in the existing panel is as follows:-

Public infrastructure

- Repainting street and public garden furniture.
- Repainting poles and parking equipment.

Building maintenance

- Repainting public walkway columns.
- Repainting graffiti damaged walls.
- Repainting public handrails, gates, bollards, stair wells, doors, and the like.

The invitation seeking tenders for a new painting maintenance panel contract was advertised in The West Australian on Wednesday, 25 November 2009.

LEGISLATION / STRATEGIC PLAN / POLICY:

Legislation Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996

Section: 11 - 24 - Tenders for Providing Goods or Services

Strategy Public Places
The city is known for its diverse range of quality public spaces that attract people to work, live and play. Vibrant public spaces ensure that Perth is a safe and enticing destination offering a “point of difference” from suburban experiences

Policy
Policy No and Name: 9.7 - Purchasing Policy

DETAILS:

Twenty nine tender documents were collected or downloaded for the City’s website during the tender period.

The tender closed at 2.00pm on Tuesday, 12 January 2010 and the following six submissions were received:-

- Colourfast Painting Contractors.
- CPD Group Pty Ltd.
- Higgins Coatings Pty Ltd.
- Perrott Painting.
- PJ and LS O’Callaghan and Sons.
- Workzone Pty Ltd.

The Schedule of Rates from each of these tenders is detailed in Schedule 4.

Tenderers had the option of tendering for one or both of the panels and were assessed against the following published qualitative criteria:-

- Schedule of works / ability to provide the services.
- Experience of key personnel / similar works.
- Support resources – personnel / equipment.
- Safety management.

The qualitative assessment process ranked the tenderers as follows:-

1. PJ and LS O'Callaghan and Sons.
2. Colourfast Painting Contractors.
3. Workzone Pty Ltd.
4. Perrott Painting.
5. Higgins Coatings Pty Ltd.
6. CPD Group Pty Ltd.

PJ and LS O'Callaghan and Sons and Colourfast Painting Contractors have been registered with the WA Painters' Registration Board since 2003 and 1997 respectively. They are two of the incumbent painting contractors and therefore possess a working knowledge of what is required when undertaking services for the City. It is reasonable to conclude that their equal highest scoring in the ability to schedule works and provide the services required, is a result of their experience with the City. They have been selected for the infrastructure painting panel as they ranked first and second respectively in the assessment matrix, provided competitive schedules of rates and represented the best value for money.

Workzone Pty Ltd originally specialised in graffiti removal products and broadened its services to encompass commercial painting and maintenance, registering with the WA Painters' Registration Board in May 2009. It has offices in Perth, Sydney and Melbourne and have been providing general maintenance painting for the City of Subiaco since May 2007. Reference checks carried out on Workzone Pty Ltd have been positive and its selection for the building maintenance panel is a result of its third highest ranking in the assessment matrix and competitive schedule of rates.

Perrott Painting has been established for many years and comprises up to 50 skilled tradesmen including a dedicated group of painters whose sole responsibility is quick turnaround projects. It has been selected for the building maintenance panel as it also ranked well in the assessment matrix and provided a competitive Schedule of Rates.

Higgins Coatings Pty Ltd has been established for many years and employs over 300 people nationwide. Its submission did not rank highly in the assessment matrix and therefore was not considered any further.

CPD Group Pty Ltd is a multi-disciplined company providing construction, refurbishment and maintenance services. It did not address the selection criteria and scored zero in the assessment matrix. As a result, its submission was not considered any further.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

Expenditure for painting maintenance is to be charged to various operating budgets.

All figures quoted in this report are exclusive of GST.

COMMENTS:

The tender called for two registered painting contractors to be appointed to each of the panels. It is considered appropriate for the four highest ranking tenders to be appointed and placed in the following panels in accordance with the most competitive schedule of rates as follows:-

Infrastructure Paint Maintenance Panel	Building Paint Maintenance Panel
Colourfast Painting Contractors	Perrott Painting
PJ and LS O'Callaghan and Sons	Workzone Pty Ltd

Moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded by Cr McEvoy

That the Council:-

- 1. accepts the tenders received from the following for the provision of paint maintenance services for a period of one year from 1 April 2010, with an option of a further two years, in accordance with the Schedule of Rates (Schedule 4):-***
 - 1.1 Colourfast Painting Contractors;***
 - 1.2 Perrott Painting;***
 - 1.3 PJ and LS O'Callaghan and Son Painting Contractors;***
 - 1.4 Workzone Pty Ltd;***
- 2. appoints the contactors in part 1 above to the following paint maintenance panels:-***

(Cont'd)

2.1 Infrastructure Paint Maintenance Panel:-

- 2.1.1 PJ and LS O'Callaghan and Son Painting Contractors;**
- 2.1.2 Colourfast Painting Contractors;**

2.2 Building Paint Maintenance Panel:-

- 2.2.1 Perrott Painting;**
- 2.2.2 Workzone Pty Ltd;**

- 3. notes the expenditure in part 1 above being charged to various operating budgets.**

The motion was put and carried

The votes were recorded as follows:-

For: The Lord Mayor, Crs McEvoy and Limnios

Against: Nil

**WK80/10 TENDER 070-09/10 - WILLIAM STREET NORTHBRIDGE
(ROE TO NEWCASTLE STREETS) - LIGHTING AND
ELECTRICAL UPGRADE WORKS**

BACKGROUND:

FILE REFERENCE: P1025690
REPORTING OFFICER: Bob Pavlovic
RESPONSIBLE DIRECTOR: Peter Monks, Director Planning and Development
DATE: 29 March 2010
MAP / SCHEDULE N/A

At its meeting held on **27 January 2009**, the Council adopted the Final Concept Plan for William Street, Northbridge, which included civil and lighting / electrical enhancement works between Roe and Newcastle Streets.

The civil construction of this project is approximately 80% complete, waiting for the new Performing Arts Centre and the new building at the Central Institute of Technology to be finished so that the last sections of footpaths in William Street can be completed. The final stage of the project, new LED lighting, is now ready for implementation.

LEGISLATION / STRATEGIC PLAN / POLICY:

Strategic Plan

Urban and Built Environment
Improvements to “street level” public spaces will be a priority, including city streets, boulevards and laneways, to improve the pedestrian amenity and create diverse, vibrant and safe public spaces

DETAILS:

On 3 February 2010 tenders were invited for the Lighting and Electrical Upgrade Works of the William Street Northbridge Enhancement Project. At close of tender on 4 March 2010, the following tenders were received and all four have been considered as compliant with the tender requirements:-

Tenderer	Proposed Cost
High Speed Electrics Pty Ltd	\$337,744
Stiles Electrical Services Pty Ltd	\$329,750
Underground Pty Ltd	\$449,475
Densford Civil Pty Ltd	\$355,285

These tenders were assessed against the following qualitative criteria:-

- Technical capability, resources and project history / experience.
- Appreciation and methodology.
- Risk management.
- Code of practice.

The following table shows the final ranking against the qualitative criteria:-

Ranking	Tenderer
1	Stiles Electrical Services Pty Ltd
2	Underground Pty Ltd
3	High Speed Electrics Pty Ltd
4	Densford Civil Pty Ltd

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

ACCOUNT NO:	CW.1215
BUDGET ITEM:	Transport, Streets, Roads, Bridges, Depots - Streetscape Enhancement - William Street (Newcastle Street to Horseshoe Bridge)
BUDGET PAGE NUMBER:	16
BUDGETED AMOUNT:	\$3,269,124
AMOUNT SPENT TO DATE:	\$1,358,309
PROPOSED COST:	\$ 329,750
BALANCE:	\$1,581 065

All figures quoted in this report are exclusive of GST.

COMMENTS

Stiles Electrical Services Pty Ltd scored the highest against the qualitative criteria. It presented a very concise, clear and easy to read tender submission which was of a high standard. It offered a very experienced team for the project and provided well documented evidence of its experience, capacity, resources, and methodology of how it would implement the works.

By comparison, the submission from High Speed Electrics Pty Ltd was considered to lack some key information. Although High Speed Electrics Pty Ltd scored highest against experience, it provided only basic information against appreciation and methodology, risk management and code practice criteria.

Underground Pty Ltd and Densford Civil Pty Ltd submitted comprehensive tenders. In particular, Underground Pty Ltd provided a lot of detail about its resources and personal qualifications. However, both companies appear to be more qualified in civil construction and lacking experience in specific street lighting installation.

Overall, Stiles Electrical Services Pty Ltd stood out from the other three companies as the most qualified, resourceful and organised company for the William Street Northbridge Lighting / Electrical Upgrade Works. In addition, its lowest tendered price clearly offers the best 'value for money'.

Moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded by Cr McEvoy

That the Council:-

- 1. accepts the most suitable tender, being that submitted by Stiles Electrical Pty Ltd, for the Lighting and Electrical Upgrade Works of William Street, Northbridge, at a cost of \$329,750 (excluding GST);***

(Cont'd)

- 2. notes the expenditure in part 1 above being charged to Budget Item 'Transport, Streets, Roads, Bridges, Depots - Streetscape Enhancement - William Street (Newcastle Street to Horseshoe Bridge)'.**

The motion was put and carried

The votes were recorded as follows:-

For: The Lord Mayor, Crs McEvoy and Limnios

Against: Nil

**WK81/10 TENDER 085-09/10 - SUPPLY OF MEDIUM PAVEMENT
SWEEPER AND SALE OF TWO SWEEPERS**

BACKGROUND:

FILE REFERENCE: P1025691
REPORTING OFFICER: John Lawn
RESPONSIBLE DIRECTOR: Vic Roberts, Acting Director Business Units
DATE: 24 March 2010
MAP / SCHEDULE: N/A

Tenders for the replacement of two existing Tennant Litter Picker Sweepers RS147 and RS148 closed on Tuesday, 23 February 2010. Both sweepers were tendered last year for replacement but could not attract suitable replacement units. After considering safety and different operating conditions, it was decided to replace these two small units with one slightly larger machine. This specialist sweeper will be used primarily to sweep the City's footpaths in Perth and act as a backup for other machines in the event of breakdowns.

LEGISLATION / STRATEGIC PLAN / POLICY:

Legislation Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996
Section: Part 4 - Tenders for Providing Goods or Services
Strategic Plan Urban and Built Environment
Improvements to "street level" public spaces will be a priority, including city streets, boulevards and laneways, to improve the pedestrian amenity and create diverse, vibrant and safe public spaces

DETAILS:

At the close of tenders, six submissions were received. The submissions are tabled below:-

Tenderer	Sweeper Model	Tender Amount \$	Trade in or Outright sale \$	Change over \$
Supply				
Tennant Company Ltd	636HS	*127,387	*6,600	*120,787
MacDonald Johnston	CN100	98,753	0	98,753
E and MJ Roshier	Karcher MC50	96,180	10,000	86,180
Rosmech	Scarab Minor	141,714	6,000	135,714
Hako	CityMaster 1200	126,609	0	126,609
Sweeper Sales QLD	Nilfisk RS502	119,200	0	119,200

* Denotes recommended expenditure.

The tender specifications for the sweeper contained the following selection criteria that tenderers were asked to address:-

- Manoeuvrability.
- Conformation to specifications.
- Parts costing and availability.
- Noise levels.
- Operator ergonomic ratings.

All the tender submissions were evaluated, however, the submissions from E and MJ Roshier for an MC50 sweeper, Sweeper Sales QLD for a Nilfisk sweeper, Rosmech for a Scarab Minor and MacDonald Johnston for a CN100 sweeper, were not deemed suitable for the City's requirements.

The MacDonald Johnston CN100 is similar to the CN200 sweeper with which the City previously has had many problems. The Nilfisk submission is from Queensland and service backup was considered a potential problem. The Scarab Minor is considered heavy and cumbersome, and beyond the City's budgeted expenditure of \$130,000. The Karcher has been demonstrated previously and found to be not as robust a machine as other comparable units.

The sweeper units, from Tennant and Hako, were shortlisted and demonstrations were arranged and carried out in Central Business District operating areas and depot with the City's sanitation staff.

The Tennant Company Ltd submission for the supply of a Green Machine 636HS sweeper was considered the most suitable submission against the selection criteria assessment. In terms of manoeuvrability, noise levels and operator safety, this unit was rated the best option for the City. For operator safety, the selected machine has a lockable enclosed cab. High pressure jets on the brooms (\$7,200) are included in this submission cost. The City's operators found the Hako unit uncomfortable in terms of ergonomics and had safety operating concerns with the Hako being an articulated machine.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

EXPENDITURE:

ACCOUNT NO:	AS000807605	
BUDGET ITEM:	Community Amenities - Sanitation - Household Refuse - Plant Replacement Program	
BUDGET PAGE NUMBER:	14	
BUDGETED AMOUNT:	\$1,128,000	\$130,000 (these 2 items)
AMOUNT SPENT TO DATE:	\$ 590,930	
PROPOSED COST:	\$ 127,387	
BALANCE:	\$ 409,683	
ANNUAL MAINTENANCE:	N/A	

INCOME:

ACCOUNT NO:	1BS0002254	
BUDGET ITEM:	Disposal of Assets - Plant Equipment - Plant Replacement Programme - Community Amenities	
BUDGET PAGE NUMBER:	13	
BUDGETED AMOUNT:	\$16,000	
AMOUNT RECEIVED TO DATE:	\$ 0	
ACTUAL INCOME:	\$ 6,600 (these two items)	
WRITTEN DOWN VALUE:	\$10,944	
(LOSS) ON CHANGEOVER:	(\$4,344)	

All figures quoted in this report are exclusive of GST.

COMMENTS:

The Green Machine is owned and serviced by Tennant Company Ltd in Western Australia. It is also accredited with Australian Standards Quality endorsement and has complied with all aspects of the City's specified requirements.

Tennant Company has excellent Western Australian representation for the supply of spare parts and servicing for the Green Machine. The City currently operates two Green Machine 525HS (smaller units) with great success.

It is recommended that the tender from Tennant Company Ltd for the supply of a Green Machine 636HS at a cost of \$127,387 (excluding GST), including the trade-in of the two old sweepers RS147 and RS148, for a total income of \$6,600 (excluding GST), be accepted. The two original sweepers will continue to be used until the new sweeping machine is delivered.

Moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded by Cr McEvoy

That the Council:-

- 1. accepts the most suitable tender, being that submitted by Tennant Company Ltd, for the supply of a Green Machine 636HS Pavement Sweeper at a cost of \$127,387 (excluding GST), including the trade-in of the two old sweepers RS147 and RS148 for a total income of \$6,600 (excluding GST);***
- 2. notes the expenditure in part 1 above being charged to Budget Item 'Community Amenities - Sanitation - Household Refuse - Plant Replacement Program'.***
- 3. notes the income in part 1 above being allocated to Budget Item 'Disposal of Assets - Plant Equipment - Plant Replacement Programme - Community Amenities'.***

The motion was put and carried

The votes were recorded as follows:-

For: The Lord Mayor, Crs McEvoy and Limnios

Against: Nil

**WK82/10 TENDER 093-09/10 - DISPOSAL OF TWO REAR
LOADER REFUSE TRUCKS**

BACKGROUND:

FILE REFERENCE: P1025811
REPORTING OFFICER: John Lawn
RESPONSIBLE DIRECTOR: Vic Roberts, Acting Director Business Units
DATE: 29 March 2010
MAP / SCHEDULE: N/A

Tenders were called and advertised for the disposal of the City's two rear loader refuse trucks (RT151 and RT297). The tender closed on 25 March 2010. These trucks have now reached their replacement period hence the reason for disposal.

LEGISLATION / STRATEGIC PLAN / POLICY:

Strategic Plan Urban and Built Environment
Improvements to "street level" public spaces will be a priority, including city streets, boulevards and laneways, to improve the pedestrian amenity and create diverse, vibrant and safe public spaces

Policy
Policy No and Name: 16.2 - Plant and Vehicles - Sale Of

DETAILS:

At the close of tenders, only one submission was received for the disposal of the two refuse trucks as detailed below:-

Tenderer	Asset - RT151 Income Amount	Asset - RT297 Income Amount
W & P Truck Sales (Vic)	*\$35,100	*\$50,554

* Denotes recommended tenderer

The selection criteria detailed in the tender specification was 'best value for money'.

Market indicators show that the above amounts tendered, even though they are slightly lower than previously sold trucks, are reasonable sale prices for these types of vehicles and still represent 'value for money' to the City.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

INCOME:

ACCOUNT NO: 1BS0002254
BUDGET ITEM: Disposal of Assets - Plant Equipment - Plant Replacement Programme - Community Amenities
BUDGET PAGE NUMBER: 13
BUDGETED AMOUNT: \$192,000 \$120,000 (these 2 items)
AMOUNT RECEIVED TO DATE: \$ 0
ACTUAL INCOME: \$ 85,654 (these 2 items)
WRITTEN DOWN VALUE: \$134,061 (these 2 items)
PROFIT (LOSS) ON CHANGEOVER: (\$ 48,407)

All figures quoted in this report are exclusive of GST.

COMMENTS:

It is recommended that the tender submission from W & P Truck Sales (Vic) for the disposal of the two rear loader refuse trucks be accepted.

Moved by the Lord Mayor, seconded by Cr McEvoy

That the Council:-

- 1. accepts the most suitable tender, being that submitted by W & P Truck Sales (Vic), for the disposal of the City's RT151 13m³ rear loader refuse truck for a total amount of \$35,100 (excluding GST);***
- 2. accepts the most suitable tender, being that submitted by W & P Truck Sales (Vic), for the disposal of the City's RT297 19m³ rear loader refuse truck for a total amount of \$50,554 (excluding GST);***
- 3. notes the income in parts 1 and 2 above being allocated to Budget Item 'Disposal of Assets - Plant Equipment - Plant Replacement Programme - Community Amenities'.***

The motion was put and carried

The votes were recorded as follows:-

For: The Lord Mayor, Crs McEvoy and Limnios

Against: Nil

**WK83/10 MOTIONS OF WHICH PREVIOUS NOTICE HAS BEEN
GIVEN**

Nil

WK84/10 GENERAL BUSINESS

1. Speed Reduction - Hay Street, West Perth

Cr Limnios requested that the City investigate the possibility of installing speed reduction devices on Hay Street, West Perth between Havelock and Thomas Streets. The Director Planning and Development advised that the matter would be investigated.

2. Cleanliness of the Northbridge Precinct

Cr Limnios advised that the Northbridge Precinct, in particular James and Lake Streets, is untidy and needs to be cleaned. The Director Business Units advised that the matter would be investigated.

3. Tree Grates in St Georges Terrace

Cr McEvoy advised that some of the tree grates in St Georges Terrace appeared to be missing. The Director Business Units advised that the matter would be investigated.

4. Cobble Stone Paving - Hay and Colin Streets, West Perth

Cr McEvoy advised that some of the cobble stone paving located on Hay and Colin Streets, West Perth, appears to be in poor condition and requires maintenance. The Director Business Units advised that the matter would be investigated.

WK85/10 ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION AT A FUTURE MEETING

Nil

WK86/10 CLOSE OF MEETING

There being no further business the Presiding Member declared the meeting closed at 6.14pm.